

## Activity 4: Document-Based Essay in Miniature

Document A: *Freedom of Expression in the NYS Constitution* (Article 1, Sections 3 and 8, NYS Constitution)

Document B: The First and Fourth Amendments to the US Constitution, 1791

### Case 1: *Shield Law*

Document C: New York Civil Rights Law § 79-h (Shield Law), Amended 2019

Document D: Memorandum of Governor Nelson A. Rockefeller, "To Amend the Civil Rights Law in Relation to Contempt," May 12, 1970

Document E: *Holmes v. Winter*, Court of Appeals, NY, 2013

Document F: Dissenting Opinion, Smith, J. (*Holmes v. Winter*, Court of Appeals, NY, 2013)

### Case 2: "*Stop and Frisk*"

Document G: Security against unreasonable searches, seizures and interceptions in the *New York State Constitution, Section 12*

Document H: Stops and Searches of Citizens by the NYPD 2012-2015

Document I: Racial Distribution of Citizens Stopped by "Stop and Frisk" Policies in New York City, 2013-15

## NYS Next Generation Learning Standards for Literacy in History/Social Studies:

### *Grades 6-8:*

- **RH1:** Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of primary and secondary sources.
- **RH2:** Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; provide an accurate, objective summary of the source distinct from prior knowledge or opinions.
- **RH8:** Distinguish among fact, opinion, and reasoned judgement in a text. Identify and distinguish between a primary and secondary source on the same topic.
- **RH9:** Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take.
- **WHST1:** Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

### *Grades 11-12:*

- **RH1:** Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of primary and secondary sources, connecting insights gained from specific details to an understanding of the source as a whole.
- **RH2:** Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary that makes clear the relationships among the key details and ideas.
- **RH4:** Interpret words and phrases, including disciplinary language, as they are developed in a text, including determining technical, connotative, and figurative meanings, and analyze how specific word choices shape meaning or tone.
- **RH6:** Evaluate authors' points of view on the same historical event or issue by assessing the authors' claims, reasoning, and evidence.
- **RH8:** Evaluate an author's premises, claims, and evidence by corroborating or challenging them with other information.
- **WHST1:** Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content.
- **WHST2:** Write explanatory and analytical text focused on discipline-specific content and which uses strategies for conveying information like those used in the respective discipline.

**Writing to Close Read Multiple Documents: Middle School:** The following scaffolded writing assignment is intended to serve as an assessable, longer piece of writing that students are able to do given their previous experience reading primary documents. Students will receive a packet of 3 documents and write a short essay that explains the documents and connects them by way of an overarching thesis or claim. This activity can be done as an in-class timed writing assignment, or it can be assigned for homework.

1. **Handout** *Middle School Document Analysis Worksheets*. These worksheets include questions to support students in their close reading of the individual documents. These worksheets can be done in class (perhaps with a partner) or assigned for homework.
2. **Handout** *Essay Assignment + Instructions*. This is a suggested essay prompt with accompanying steps for students to follow in order to turn their worksheet answers into a cohesive essay that offers an argument that connects the three documents. The parameters of the assignment (length, etc.) are left vague so that they can be customized.

**Document-Based Essay in Miniature: High School:** Given that the “document-based question” (DBQ) appears frequently in high school history curricula, this activity and assignment aims to help students to understand the process of writing a DBQ, from understanding the assignment and documents to writing the essay itself. Most DBQ’s involve at least five primary documents, so this activity asks students to draw on any of the documents they’ve worked with thus far, as well as an additional three documents focused on “Stop and Frisk” (nine documents total).

- **Given that students will have already done the Case Law Jigsaw with Documents C-F**, these are not included as part of the document analysis handouts with questions. For these documents direct students to the worksheets they completed for the Case Law Jigsaw.
- **Documents A-B and G-I** are included in the packet of handouts with accompanying questions.
- **Working Towards Your Document-Based Essay in Miniature** serves as a guide to help students move from the writing they did to a more formal thesis-driven essay. The parameters/requirements of the assignment are left vague so that they can be easily customized.

\*\*The Middle School/High School designations on these assignments are not restrictive. Feel free to use whichever sequence of activities you think will work best given the students in your classes.